

Registrars' and Users' Consultative Committees

Minutes of the plenary meeting

26/03/2020

afnic

Contents

1. Attending remotely	3
2. Agenda.....	4
3. Minutes.....	4
3.1. Welcome and News update	4
3.2. Discussion item	5
3.2.1. Updating of the Naming Charter to include the IDN variants of the .gouv.fr TLD.....	5
3.2.2. Packaged online presence offers with registrars dedicated to young people and VSEs/SMEs.....	6
3.2.3. Afnic as a training organisation	8
3.3. Closure	9
3.4. Information update.....	10

1. Attending remotely

Registrars: 13 (out of 38 members)

DATAXY	DULAC	Bernard
DOMAINIUM	FRANCK	Philippe
EURODNS	SEUFER	Luc
GANDI	RAMOIN	Stephan
GANDI	FRANQUINET	Arnaud
IKOULA	CLOSSON	Alain
NAMEBAY	LANTONNET	Eric
NEOCAMINO	GALATI	Michèle
NEOCAMINO	PERON	Sébastien
NORDNET	JUNG	Scott
ONE2NET	GEOFFROY	Pierre
ORDIPAT	KORN	Jennifer
ORDIPAT	DESTENAVE	Sylvie
ORANGE	JEAN-GILLES	Sophie
OVH	DESSENDIER	Julie
OVH	CANER	Emma
SAFEBRANDS	GUILLEMAUT	Frédéric

Users, natural and legal persons: 12 (out of 37 members)

ASS. E-SENIORS	BACHOLLET	Anne-Marie
	BACHOLLET	Sébastien
	BATREAU	Philippe
E BRAND Services	BERECZ	Pierre
	BOUTIGNON	Antoine
ISOC France	CHAGNY	Nicolas
	CHELLY	David
	LOUIS	Benjamin
	MORENETS	Yuliya
	PORTENEUVE	Elisabeth
	TAYER	David-Irving
	VILLEMINOT	Théo

Attending on behalf of Afnic:

Benoît AMPEAU, Lotfi BENYELLES, Pierre BONIS, Sophie CANAC, Loïc DAMILAVILLE, Clémence DAVOUST, Marianne GEORGELIN, Camille HURE, Régis MASSE, Lucile RAVASSE, Emilie TURBAT, Mickael VIGREUX.

2. Agenda

The agenda was adapted to take account of the fact that the meeting was held entirely remotely.

- 09h30: Welcome and News update
Afnic business continuity plan and potential impact on revenues
- 10h15: Exchanges on the items for discussion with the committees
- stipulations to be added to the naming charter concerning the **.gouv.fr** TLD
 - packaged online presence offers with registrars dedicated to young people and VSEs/SMEs
 - Afnic as a training organisation
- 11h15: Separate Consultative Committee meetings
- 12h15: Feedback from the committees
- 12h45: Agenda for upcoming events
Addresses by any election candidates
- 13h15: End

The information updates planned for the afternoon would be available to members in the members' area and would not be the subject of any presentation during the session.

- Initial assessment of the young people's programme
- Amendment to the justification procedure
- Market trends in domain names

3. Minutes

3.1. Welcome and News update

Pierre Bonis introduced the session by recalling the items on the agenda for this meeting, which was held entirely online due to the health crisis.

With lockdown, Afnic had shifted to a working from home arrangement, with only the IT teams entering the premises as and when necessary. There were no major concerns regarding Afnic's revenues, the effect on the .fr TLD being very limited, but there was a risk that the advisory and training activities would be affected. Emilie Turbat and her teams had contacted clients with a view to avoiding the cancellation of domain names that might arise as a result of the disorderly situation. Afnic had offered payment facilities to registrars experiencing difficulties.

3.2. Discussion item

3.2.1. Updating of the Naming Charter to include the IDN variants of the .gouv.fr TLD

Marianne Georgelin explained this subject to members.

The '.gouv.fr' TLD

- The .gouv.fr TLD, she said, was reserved to registrations of the government.
- IDN versions of the .gouv.fr TLD were not indicated as being covered by the same protection, and third parties had sought to register them.
- Afnic's view was that the registration of such variants was highly likely to confuse the public, as well as increasing the risk of fraudulent practices that would be impossible to prevent.
- In order to ensure that IDN versions of .gouv.fr were not registered by third parties, Afnic proposed to amend the naming charter to indicate expressly that these versions were also reserved to the government. This amendment would not be retroactive.
- There were 29 IDN versions of the .gouv.fr TLD in all:
 - 25 had now been registered by Afnic;
 - four had been registered by third parties (but were not currently used to create subdomains).

Naming Charter

Article 2.5 - The '.gouv.fr' TLD

34. The '.gouv.fr' TLD [and its IDN versions](#) are reserved to the French government.

35. The required documentation to obtain an authorisation code is as follows:

An identifier in the SIRENE register or any other official document that identifies the entity, and
Validation by the French Government Information Service (SIG).

Milestones for amending the charter

- Proposal submitted to the registry policy committee of the Board of Trustees on 11 March → APPROVED by the Committee.
- Proposal submitted for consultation to the users' and registrars' committees
- Once the committee's opinions had been received, the proposal was submitted to the Board of Trustees on 7 April for resolution
- Immediate publication of the naming charter as soon as the resolutions of the Board of Trustees had been announced.

Feedback from the committees:

Users' position:

Users wanted to know which domains had been registered and by whom.

The question arose as to other subdomains such as those of .aeroport.fr. They asked whether it would be helpful to communicate with them, informing them of the IDN risk, and whether the naming charter should be amended for them.

Finally, questions were raised about the retroactive effect of the charter; it might be a good idea to look more closely at the notion of renewal, and in particular how the charter would be applied to renewals and avoid its being circumvented by “re-registration”.

On the other hand, care must be taken to avoid damaging the stability of the .fr TLD by opening the Pandora’s box of retroactivity.

Registrars’ position:

The registrars shared Afnic’s opinion and had no other observations to make.

Afnic mentioned that the registered domains contained accents or diaereses.

Other TLDs were not covered by the policy. Some subdomains were managed by other bodies (for example those of .avocat.fr are managed by the bar association).

For .gouv.fr, monitoring was in place for the four domain names registered.

One member added that warning people about registering IDNs of sector activities, which were available on Afnic’s website, might actually make it easier for these people, who were not necessarily aware of the finer points.

3.2.2. Packaged online presence offers with registrars dedicated to young people and VSEs/SMEs

Emilie Turbat and Lucile Ravasse presented this topic to the members.

Over the past four years Afnic had become a key player in supporting VSEs and SMEs with their online presence, thanks to the Réussir-en.fr (“Succeed with .fr”) and Foliweb (workshops) schemes. (160 Foliweb workshops held in 2019; more than 50,000 VSEs/SMEs made internet-savvy in four years)

Since 2019 it had also been supporting young people in mastering their online presence.

As a next step, Afnic proposed to create **inexpensive, ready-made, easy-to-use packages** to help VSEs/SMEs and young people develop their online presence. These offers could be promoted within the framework of Afnic’s and its partners’ arrangements.

The questions asked by Afnic and its members:

- **What should the packages contain?** Depending on the level of maturity? What level of support to include?
 - Example for VSEs: email, hosting, website creation tools, updating and security provided by the hoster; turnkey so as not to be redirected to own updates, by WordPress for example
 - Package depending on levels of maturity of the VSE/SME, scalable with addition of reference component, e-commerce, etc.
 -
- **What tariffs?** Special low tariffs for the launch?
 - An inexpensive package would be desirable
 - The *Réussir avec le web* (“Succeed on the Web”) survey put this tariff at less than €300 a year for an online presence
 - €30 for a young person?
- **What about labelling?** What criteria for a label for VSEs/SMEs?

Pierre Bonis pointed out that Afnic was not going to market directly; it was a matter of finding out what registrars proposed specifically for VSEs/SMEs in a more visible way with a label (by France Num

("France Digital") for example). The idea would be to promote these packages on France Num and Réussir-en.fr in order to direct VSEs/SMEs towards offers that were suited to them, with a minimum of services included in the offer.

The registrar members pointed out that:

- some registrars were not looking to penetrate this target group, since it involved too much technical support,
- these packages existed, but registrars did not make money on them, and support staff wasted a lot of time on basic assistance; the packages should be coupled with user training
- if Afnic could provide training, this could also contribute to this discussion.

Pierre Bonis reminded the meeting that Afnic already runs training free of charge through the "Foliweb" workshops and réussir-en.fr.

Feedback from the committees:

Users' position:

The users agreed on the importance of helping users register domains and develop uses. It was important to be able to rely on labelling that provided security.

Concern was expressed about the price and content of the packages, especially for young people, the €30 mentioned seeming too much to some.

These packages would allow generic email solutions such as gmail and hotmail to be combated, so they were a good idea, but not easy to implement. Reliance must be placed on improving uses, data protection, image (VSEs) and proposing simple, useful tools as extras: diary, forms, mailing lists, etc., while at the same time keeping an eye on overly elaborate mechanisms and user experience.

"Digital identity" pack: was secured, labelled with .fr It would be a plus for .fr, particularly if it bore a nice label

An additional target to bear in mind: associations with substantial needs (tools referred to above).

There should be communication based on the content of the labelled packages.

For the labelling, bodies such as AFNOR (French standards association), chambers of commerce and handicraft and federations should be contacted. These might also be vectors of communication, promotion of packages or even distribution/sales of services.

Registrars' position:

The question of tariffs posed a problem for the registrars.
It was important to help SMEs/SMIs establish themselves online.

Implementation could take place via the Afnic website or with a first-level portal containing basic information on what is needed for an online presence, including tutorials, webinars and training courses, which would then be linked to a list of players meeting the needs of applicants.

The registrars asked Afnic to propose a technical (or organisational) solution to train and inform clients and manage communications between clients and Afnic, and to give basic level training to clients.

Could Afnic provide first-level support to new users?

The door should be left open for expert packages (without price ceiling)

An alternative would be to have the packages sponsored.

Pierre Bonis and Emilie Turbat said they appreciated the amount and quality of feedback given.

Concerning the tariff, the aim was to give an indication of the maximum budget that it would cost to have an online presence.

Réussir-en.fr was already well equipped and could be the portal suggested by the registrars.

One member said that the price of the minimum requirements for going digital could be shared among new users, but care would have to be taken with the wording because of the need to leave open the possibility of more services being added depending on the means and needs of the VSEs/SMEs.

Pierre Bonis confirmed that although the entry-level package had to have a maximum tariff, there must indeed be no impediment to possible subsequent extensions. Support would in principle be mandatorily included in the basic package for craftsmen.

3.2.3. Afnic as a training organisation

Lotfi Benyelles presented this topic to the members.

Why should Afnic become a training organisation?

The situation at present:

- Afnic sells training to businesses or training bodies
- Contract for the provision of services
- Provision of expertise possibly requiring only logistics

The situation afterwards:

- Afnic would train individuals to acquire skills (in the context of an individual project)
- Training contract with the person or agreement with his or her employer
- Afnic to issue a certificate as an approved training organisation

Obtaining approval is a lever for the development of a training activity: Our clients' employees would be able to obtain aid to finance their training.

- Through their Personal Training Account (CPF or former DIF) if the training provides a certificate
- Through OPCO ("operators of competence", formerly OPCA)
- Through the Pôle Emploi (state employment agency) in other cases.

Our clients would be able to obtain additional funding to train their employees.

An opportunity for our partners and clients

- To strengthen the DNS expertise of French companies and help them secure their infrastructure
- To enable our clients and their employees to benefit from several financing options
- To strengthen partnerships with our registrars who wish to enrich their catalogue of offers.

Objective of the training offering: To strengthen the security of the DNS

DNS security would be at the heart of our training offer.

- Afnic training courses would enable our clients to master and upgrade their essential infrastructures (DNS services and IPv6 transition).
- Afnic would integrate into the content of its training courses knowledge from its many years of experience as the .fr registry and technical registry operator.
- Our experts would make use of concrete and practical cases of DNS and IPv6 infrastructure optimisation.

The training offering and our skills transfer actions

- The training offering is aimed at professionalising players in the security and DNS market.
- It would not affect our skills transfer actions already carried out elsewhere (Foliweb, JCSA, Collège International, etc.).

Details of the offering

Initially, three offers based on our centre of expertise and which could be carried out at our premises or at our clients' or partners' premises

- The bases of the DNS
- Deploying DNSSEC
- Implementing Ipv6

How far advanced is Afnic?

Before the end of H1 2020:

- Establishment of the training agreement → completed
- Establishment of the training programme → completed
- Prospecting of clients → completed
- Request for approval as soon as we sign the first order → in progress
- Complete and send the dossier to the DIRECCTE (Regional Department of Enterprise, Competition, Consumer Affairs, Labour and Employment)
- Approval obtained in 30 days

In H2 2020:

- Consolidation of the offer and communication
- Certification of regulations for 2021

Feedback from the committees:

Users' position:

Suggestion to extend the training offer to broader and more accessible topics: marketing, practices, etc. and to approach the SEO Camp community.

Registrars' position:

Information on training subjects should be a little broader (e.g. pre-pack portal) and training subjects should be organised into larger groups so as to widen the audience.

All registrars would benefit from these training sessions since not all registrars managed DNS and security at the same level.

Afnic took due note of the members' proposal not to restrict itself to its recognised fields of expertise.

Lotfi Benyelles pointed out that Afnic had left its "comfort zone" to obtain approval in 2020. If certain training courses did not work, they would not remain in the catalogue, and there were plans to extend the range of courses on offer.

3.3. Closure

Sophie Canac reminded members of the deadlines for candidacies to the elections of representatives on Afnic's Board of Trustees:

- **9 April 2020 at 19:00:** closing of applications (candidates would receive an acknowledgement of receipt by email)
- **10 April to 14 May 2020:** verification by the nomination validation committee of the admissibility of the candidacies (candidates may be contacted)
- **15 May 2020:** publication of the final list of candidates, their manifestos and their declarations of interest, on the Afnic website
- **5 June 2020:** General Assembly and elections. The new Board of Trustees would meet immediately afterwards.

The General Assembly of the association might be held remotely on 5 June or postponed to a later date. The decision would be taken by the Board of Trustees in its meeting of 7 April. An email would be sent to members to inform them of this.

In any case, the meeting must be held, whatever the form and procedures, as in addition to electing the representatives of the colleges to the Board of Trustees, it had to approve the 2019 financial statements.

The next consultative committee meetings would take place on 19 November 2020.

Finally, Pierre Bonis asked the members if any of them wished to take the opportunity to declare their candidacy for the Afnic Board of Trustees.

The following spoke:

- For the registrars:
 - Gandi Stephan Ramoin
 - Ikoula Alain Closson
 - Orange Sophie Jean-Gilles
- For the users:
 - ISOC France Nicolas Chagny and Sébastien Bachollet

3.4. Information update

Information topics were shared with members in the form of a single document:

- DoH
- Initial assessment of the young people's programme
- Amendment to the justification procedure
- Market trends in domain names

Afnic employees remain at the disposal of members who have questions on these subjects.

Exceptionally, trends in the domain name market were given to all members, whereas hitherto this subject had always been exclusive to the members present at the consultative committee meetings.