

Registrars' and Users' Consultative Committees



Minutes of 14 March 2024

CONTENTS

1.	ATTENDEES	4
2.	AGENDA	6
3.	WELCOME AND NEWS UPDATE.....	7
3.1.	NEWS UPDATE.....	7
3.2.	FORTHCOMING ELECTIONS TO THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES IN JUNE 2024.	9
3.3.	WSIS+20 – CONSULTATION	11
4.	UPDATE ON DISCUSSION ITEMS FROM THE LAST CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE MEETING.....	12
4.1.	COMMON SYSTEM FOR THE VERIFICATION OF HOLDERS’ CONTACT DATA	12
4.2.	GRADUATED SANCTIONS ON REGISTRARS WHO DO NOT FULFIL THEIR COMMITMENTS REGARDING THE FIGHT AGAINST ABUSE.....	18
4.3.	LAUNCH OF THE TWG ON ABUSE.....	23
5.	SUBJECTS RAISED BY MEMBERS THROUGH THEIR REPRESENTATIVES ...	24
5.1.	LIST OF TERMS SUBJECT TO PRIOR REVIEW	24
6.	PRESENTATION OF POINTS SUBMITTED FOR CONSULTATION WITH MEMBERS.....	26
6.1.	FINANCING OPTIONS FOR THE 11% GENERAL INTEREST BEYOND THE AMOUNT EARMARKED FOR THE FOUNDATION AND FOR ACTIONS WITH THE INTERNATIONAL COLLEGE	26
6.1.1.	<i>Presentation by Afnic</i>	<i>26</i>
6.1.2.	<i>Feedback from Registrars’ and Users’ Consultative Committees</i>	<i>27</i>
6.2.	2024 ACTION PLAN FOR RENEWAL OF THE ASSOCIATION’S PROMISE	28
6.2.1.	<i>Presentation by Afnic</i>	<i>28</i>
6.2.2.	<i>Feedback from Registrars’ and Users’ Consultative Committees</i>	<i>34</i>

7.	UPCOMING DIARY DATES	37
-----------	-----------------------------------	-----------

1. Attendees

Users

20 persons (10 in person and 10 remotely) representing 17 members of the college.

- BACHOLLET Sébastien, representing ISOC France
- BIRCKER Fabrice, representing Plasseraud IP
- BOUTIGNON Antoine
- CHAGNY Nicolas, representing ISOC France
- CHAUMONT Eugénie
- CHELLY David
- FITZJEAN O COBHTHAIGH Alexis
- LESVENAN David, representing Association www.bzh
- LOUIS Benjamin, representing .alsace
- MCHATET Abdel
- MORENETS Yuliya
- NGUYEN François
- PAWLAK Nicolas
- PERPERE PAUL, representing INPI
- POPINEAU Claire, representing ISOC France
- PORTENEUVE Elisabeth
- PRET Charline, representing Novagraaf
- PRUNIERES Lucie, representing Made in IP
- TAYER David-Irving
- VALLADE Mélanie, representing Novagraaf

Registrars

21 persons (8 in person and 13 remotely) representing 16 members of the college.

- ALMIRON Sébastien, representing NETIM

- CALLOCH Antoine, representing OVH Cloud
- CANER Emma, representing OVH Cloud
- DESSENS Emilie, representing DOMAINOO
- DON Anthony, representing SOLIDNAMES
- DULAC Bernard, representing DATAXY
- ENGRAND Sophie, representing NORDNET
- FRANCK Philippe, representing DOMAINIUM
- FRANQUINET Arnaud, representing GANDI
- FRIGAULT Laurent, representing SCALEWAY
- GEOFFROY Pierre, representing ONE2NET
- HAUSS Patrick, representing CSC
- JEAN-GILLES Sophie, representing ORANGE
- JUNG Scott, representing NORDNET
- KARA Soraya, representing GANDI
- KORN Jennifer, representing ORDIPAT
- LANTONNET Eric, representing DIGITAL GROUP SERVICES
- MANCEC Gaël, representing CABINET GERMAIN MAUREAU
- MICHOT Jean-Claude, representing SCALEWAY
- SAINTPIERRE Julien, representing DOMAINOO
- WITTERSHEIM Arnaud, representing NAMESHIELD

Afnic

- AMPEAU Benoit, Partnerships & Innovations Director
- APFELBAUM Gabrielle, Communications Director
- BATIFOULIER Caroline, R&D Partnerships and Projects Support Officer
- BONIS Pierre, CEO
- CANAC Sophie, Head of Associative Governance
- CASTEX Lucien, Representative for Public Affairs
- GEORGELIN Marianne, Legal Director, Head of Registry Policy & Public Affairs

- MASSÉ Régis, Information Systems Director
- PASSEREAU Mégane, Assistant to General Management
- TURBAT Emilie, Marketing and Commercial Director

2. Agenda

- News update
- Update on discussion items from the last Consultative Committee meeting
- Items added to the Agenda following feedback from the members via their representatives
 - List of terms subject to prior review
- Development of a roadmap of items added at the request of the members for the two upcoming Consultative Committee meetings
- Presentation of points submitted for consultation:
 - Financing options for the 11% general interest beyond the amount earmarked for the Foundation and for actions with the International College
 - 2024 action plan for renewal of the Association's promise
- Separate consultative committee sessions
- Feedback of opinions of the consultative committees
- Informal exchanges & upcoming Afnic diary dates
- Networking
- Special extraordinary meeting of the consultative committee on NIS 2

3. Welcome and news update

Pierre Bonis and the co-chairs thanked the members in attendance at Afnic's new premises and those attending remotely. He ran through the day's agenda, which would be divided into a members' consultation phase and a phase for feedback of opinions and discussion. It would be followed by an extraordinary meeting of the Consultative Committee on the NIS 2 Directive, extending to non-members.

3.1. News update

- Afnic's move to its new headquarters in Guyancourt. This meeting of the Consultative Committee is the first opportunity for members to see the new premises.
- Ongoing discussions and debates with ANSSI, the French cyber-security agency, on the NIS 2 Directive. At the beginning of December 2023, a meeting of the State/Afnic liaison committee took place with ANSSI and the DGE (Directorate General for Enterprise) on how to transpose the Directive into French law.

After today's meeting of the Consultative Committee there will be an extraordinary consultative committee meeting on the impacts of NIS 2 on domain names, extended to non-Afnic members.

The legal framework governing domain name management will be defined more precisely by Article L45 of the French Post and Electronic Communications Code (CPCE).

- One of the strategic priorities for 2024 of Afnic's Board of Trustees is to move forward on the three French overseas TLDs in the Caribbean for which Afnic is not the registry operator.

Given its experience and know-how, Afnic can envisage establishing contact with the current operators with a view to assisting them with the management of these registries.

- Feedback from the Afnic teams following their week in Puerto Rico at the ICANN79 Community Forum. The opening date for the next submission period for new gTLDs in 2026 is in the process of being finalised. Certain aspects are still being discussed, for example the precise procedures and the amount of the application fee.

- Régis Massé, Afnic's Director of Information Systems, said he was proud to share with members ICANN's decision to use Zonemaster, the application developed by Afnic in collaboration with its Swedish counterpart, for all automatic DNS and DNSSEC tests for future pre-delegations of back-end registry operators.
- Security for the ICANN81 AGM in Istanbul in November 2024 is being organised. A workshop, organised by the TLD-OPS working group (the ccNSO's cyber-security group), is planned with a view to helping modest-sized registries draw up a defence, business continuity and communication plan in the event of cyber-attack.
- ICANN has also announced the end of the obligation for gTLDs to provide a directory service based on the WHOIS protocol with effect from 28 January 2025. This system will be entirely replaced by the RDAP protocol. The database of holders will continue to exist for the proper functioning of the Registry.
- Numerous exchanges have also taken place with the International College for the preparation of ICANN80 in Kigali, Rwanda, where Afnic can count on a strong representation from its African counterparts. As part of the "Coalition for Digital Africa" programme, Afnic will run a training session for the beneficiary registries present ahead of the ICANN meeting.

- The next edition of our quarterly Letter to Public Decision-Makers will contain an article on Universal Acceptance: <https://www.afnic.fr/observatoire-ressources/observatoire/la-lettre-afnic-a-destination-des-decideurs-publics/>

3.2. Forthcoming elections to the Board of Trustees in June 2024.

As a reminder, one of the two representatives of the College of Registrars, Arnaud Franquinet, has expressed the wish for his term of office as Trustee not to be renewed. Sincere thanks were expressed for all his involvement throughout the four years of his term of office, through his participation, his experience and his representational capacity within the various bodies of Afnic.

Elections at the 2024 General Meeting – 2 Colleges concerned

- First round held online one week before the General Meeting, followed by a possible second round online and in person during the General Meeting.

Terms of office up for election:

- Users' College – ISOC France, (represented by Sébastien Bachollet)
- Registrars' College – GANDI, (represented by Arnaud Franquinet)

Some reminders about the Articles of Association and the association's internal regulations on elections:

- A Nomination Validation Committee composed of three members must be appointed by the Board of Trustees (Article 11.1 of the Articles of Association)
- Candidacies must be submitted to Afnic no less than six weeks prior to the date of the General Meeting (Internal Regulations of the Association, 2.3.2d)

Reverse schedule of the elections to be held at the 2024 GM

- Meeting of the Board of Trustees of 7 February:
 - Establishment of the Nomination Validation Committee (composed of three non-candidate members appointed by the Board of Trustees)

- Approval of the amended declarations of interest form
- Between 8 February and 28 February:
 - Preparation of all the document templates for candidates
 - Launch of the campaign: Email sent to registrars inviting them to apply for election as members of the Registrars' College (15 February)
- Until 28 March:
 - Declaration of candidacies: candidates submit their manifestos and declarations of interest
- Early April:
 - Verification of admissibility of candidacies by the Nomination Validation Committee
- Meeting of the Board of Trustees of 3 or 4 April:
 - Resolution to call the OGM
- Mid-April (before 23 April)
 - Publication of validated candidacies in the members' space of the website
 - Start of the online electoral campaign
- End of April or before 14 May
 - Online meeting for the presentation of the candidates for the Registrars' and User's members – Questions/Answers
 - Introduction by the Validation Committee
- No later than 14 May:
 - Sending of electronic call notice to the General Meeting (to all members)
 - Information to candidates on the electorate
- 27 to 28 May:
 - Opening of voting for one week
 - Second round between 24 and 48 hours before the General Meeting, online
- OGM of 4 June
 - GM, physical or remote, vote counting
 - Statement appointing the new Trustee

3.3. WSIS+20 – Consultation

Internet Governance in 2024: WSIS+20 context and the negotiation of a Global Digital Compact

A context of Internet governance reform in 2024 and 2025

→ **Since 2005:** progressive development and increasing complexity of the information society.

→ **Importance of taking part, for Afnic and for the French Internet community.**

Summit to negotiate a Pact for the Future which will include a Global Digital Compact

→ **For 2024**

→ A consultation phase on the architecture of the pact, ended on 8 March 2024:
participation of Afnic.

→ Publication of an initial version of the Compact, referred to as the “zero draft”, expected at the end of April 2024, to be followed by inter-governmental discussion with the aim of its being adopted in September 2024.

The World Summit on the Information Society +20

→ **Review after 20 years of the WSIS:** tensions around the multi-stakeholder model and means of governance.

→ **Consultation phase open until 31 March 2024 → draft response from Afnic**

Internet governance: WSIS+20 consultation

Questionnaire on the implementation of the WSIS (CSTD, ITU, UNESCO, UNDP)

- **The WSIS lays the bases of Internet governance with which we are familiar:** distribution of mandates within the United Nations, emergence of new actors, and it **acknowledges the role of stakeholders in Internet governance**
- **Contributions expected by 31 March 2024.**
 - The call is open to **all stakeholders**: contribution published by ISPCP, for example.
 - **Draft contribution from Afnic** on which we hereby **invite comments from our members**
- Opening 14 March 2024 → Closing 25 March 2024 → Finalisation and submission on 31 March 2024

Members will receive an invitation email in the coming days allowing them to take part in Afnic's submission by contributing their views on the subject.

4. Update on discussion items from the last Consultative Committee meeting

4.1. Common system for the verification of holders' contact data

Reminder of the agenda:

- Public Consultation: reminders and summary
- Holder contact tags: review
- Development of reachability checks since 2021
- Reachability since 1 January 2024
- Conclusion

Public Consultation

From 16 October to 24 November 2023, as part of its efforts to strengthen the fight against abuse, Afnic submitted to public consultation a **plan to introduce a common system for the verification of data of holders** of .fr and French overseas domain names (.re, .pm, .tf, .wf and .yt).

The purpose of this motivational system is to encourage the sending of **reachability and eligibility information** to the Registry for each holder contact within one month of the create operation, thus allowing:

- consolidation of the verification systems applied by the registrars and by the Registry
- improvement of the quality of verified holder data
- better visibility of the number of .fr name holders whose data have been verified

Summary of responses:

We received nine contributions to this consultation.

The respondent profile was varied: registrars, users and intellectual property firms.

We would like to thank them for their participation and for the complementarity of their proposals.

The responses received confirm that the implementation of a common system for verifying holders' data is of value in the fight against abuse, even though some concerns were expressed regarding the complexity of the process and the indicated time frames.

The other responses as a whole showed a strong desire for collaboration between Afnic and the registrars with the aim of maintaining accurate and complete data in the WHOIS database and ensuring their integrity. It seems that a trusted, common model would be most welcome.

Review:

Reachability and eligibility tags:

- At 1 March 2024, in the .FR zone

Out of a total of 3,338,352 registered holder contacts:

- **221,374 had a reachability tag**
- 389,986 had an eligibility tag
- At 1 March 2024, in the French overseas zone
(*all overseas TLDs together*)

Out of a total of 45,603 registered holder contacts:

- 3,676 had a reachability tag
- 4,190 had an eligibility tag

Focus on reachability tags and their ReachSource

- At 1 March 2024, in the .FR zone

Out of 221,374 reachability tags:

- **162,418 were provided by registrars**
- 59,316 were provided by Afnic

At 1 March 2024, in the French overseas zone

(*all overseas TLDs together*)

Out of a total of 3,676 reachability tags:

- 3,263 were provided by registrars
- 413 were provided by Afnic

Change in number of reachability verifications made on registrars' initiative

FR: Change in the number of reachability tags sent by registrars (since 2021)

The common system for the verification of holders' contact data has been in effect since 1 January 2024.

Since then, we have seen **a significant increase** in reachability data sent to us by the registrars.

- January 2023: 2,575 / January 2024: 12,187, an increase of 373%
- February 2023: 4,133 / February 2024: 20,672, an increase of 400%

French Overseas Change in the number of reachability tags sent by registrars (since 2021)

The common system for the verification of holders' contact data has been in effect since 1 January 2024.

Since then, we have seen **a significant increase** in reachability data sent.

- January 2023: 34 / January 2024: 194, an increase of 470%
- February 2023: 50 / February 2024: 178, an increase of 256%

Focus on the past two months

Number of reachability tags sent by registrars in respect of 2024 create operations

As a reminder, contact information for each holder must be sent to the Registry **within one month** of the create operation

For the period 1 January 2024 to 1 March 2024:

144,525 NIC handles were created in the **FR zone**.

– **16,103 (11.1%)** had an associated reachability tag.

15,182 were tagged on the day of creation.

The average delay between the create operation and the checks was **1.3 days**.

1,984 NIC handles were created in the **French overseas zone** (*all overseas TLDs together*):

– **292 (14.7%)** had an associated reachability tag.

233 were tagged on the day of creation.

The average delay between the create operation and the checks was **2.8 days**.

Checks by registrars on reachability in respect of names created before 2024

We note that registrars have taken advantage of the implementation of the common system to send us reachability tags relating to names created before 1 January 2024.

Since 1 January 2024:

- 32,859 reachability verifications sent for the **FR zone** of which **16,756 (51%)** for creations prior to 1 January 2024.
- 372 reachability verifications sent for the **French overseas zone** (all overseas TLDs together) of which **80 (21.5%)** for creations prior to 1 January 2024.

Conclusion

Overview: some positive aspects, and some progress yet to be made

Since 1 January 2024 and the implementation of the common system, we have observed that:

- The overall number of reachability tags for holder contacts has increased substantially, by 375% on average.

- Registrars sending reachability information **largely** complied with the one-month from creation limit for sending information to the Registry.
- Registrars also checked contact details of holders of domain names created prior to 2024.

Nevertheless, the number of tags in the Registry's database remains insufficient.

Indeed **contact details of holders of fewer than 12% of domain names created since 1 January 2024** were the subject of "Eligstatus" reports using the EPP protocol (also available through the web services and the APIs put in place by Afnic).

All taking action

By way of reminder, following the public consultation and the concerns you expressed, we decided to place the stress initially on the importance of reporting reachability information.

We therefore ask all our registrars to please continue to submit reachability status reports on holders who have registered a domain name, in the month following this registration.

And as regards the verification of eligibility, we would also remind you that the system put in place requires registrars to report the eligibility status in 100% of cases in which verification is carried out.

The discussions and questions-and-answers between the members and Afnic allowed the following points to be clarified:

Pierre Bonis observed that these initial figures were very encouraging and he thanked the registrars for their efforts in sending reachability information to the Registry.

Benoît Ampeau, Partnerships and Innovations Director, stressed the fact that Afnic wished to capitalise on the procedures already existing and implemented by the registrars.

A registrar also pointed out that, for gTLDs, ICANN required registrars to present registered name holders with the current registration data and ask them to confirm the data or make any necessary alterations at least once a year

(<https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/registrars/consensus-policies/drp-en>). Thus, if the holder also has a .fr domain name, Afnic will receive the information provided by the holder.

4.2. Graduated sanctions on registrars who do not fulfil their commitments regarding the fight against abuse

Follow-up on implementation of the project

A commitment in the State/Afnic Agreement

Paragraph 9: Fight against abuse (page 8)

The registry undertakes, after consultation with the governing bodies of the association, to put in place a system of graduated sanctions against registrars that are insufficiently responsive to legitimate requests from public authorities and that have a significant percentage of registrations involved in cases of technical abuse or that do not take sufficient action following indications of cases of technical abuse (...).

Results of the design work: monitoring indicators

- **Threshold: 0.24%** – A key indicator, the rate of abusive incidents in registrars' portfolios:

The rate and the list of abusive incidents detected will be provided to the registrars every month to allow them to combat abuse.

- **Repeated alerts and failings** – indicators of actions taken by registrars:

– Evaluation of reactivity in responses to legitimate requests of public authorities: trigger threshold = one alert by a public authority in the month

-Evaluation of reactivity following alerts of incidents of technical abuse by Afnic:
registrars must take charge of incidents reported and send processing reports to Afnic.
Repeated failure to take charge of incidents will trigger the procedure

- **Body of evidence – Complementary indicators constituting a body of evidence:**

- > Indicators of the reliability of registration data linked to the registrar's domain names:
set of indicators on substantiation procedures leading to deletion of domain names
- > Indicators of disputes (ADR) regarding the registrar's domain names leading to delete
or compulsory transfer operations
- > Indicators of alerts, digital injunctions and identity theft

Results of the design work: graduated sanctions

- **72 hours for action plan – Remediation phase:** if an indicator threshold is passed and/or an anomaly detected, the registrar is contacted by Afnic. The registrar will then have 72 hours in which to commit to resolving the failings observed and submit an action plan for dealing with domain names reported for abuse within one week and returning below the threshold exceeded (rate of incidences of abuse in the portfolio) within two months.
- **1 month in which to regularise – Notification of default phase and application of financial sanctions:** the registrar is notified of the failings detected and served formal notice to regularise the situation within one month. During this phase, any substantiation procedure that Afnic has to carry out on the registrar's portfolio will be invoiced to the registrar at the rate of €100 per case.

Afnic will publish the fact that formal notice has been served on the registrar as a result of failings in the management of cases of abuse. In the event that the situation is regularised within the term granted, this too will be made public.
- **1 month maximum in which to regularise – Phase of temporary suspension of the registrar's operations:** Afnic will proceed to temporarily suspend the registrar's operations (blocking of the account) for a maximum period of one month. The

account will be unblocked only once the registrar has brought its management of abuse into compliance.

- **15 days prior notice – Phase of termination of the registration contract and withdrawal of accreditation:** The termination of the registration contract will be notified to the registrar with 15 days' prior notice. Afnic publishes the information on withdrawal of accreditation; removal from the directory of registrars takes effect from the beginning of the prior notice period.

Following termination of contract, no new accreditation will be possible for that registrar for a period of three years.

In the event of repeated failings, specifically if Afnic has suspended operations on the registrar's account three times in any two-year period, Afnic will proceed to terminate the registration contract.

Graduated sanction documents

Reference framework of good practices for managing abuse:

- Description of control indicators and their thresholds or use in bodies of evidence to describe failings in dealing with abuse.
- Description of expected actions for dealing with abuse
- Description of the procedure for applying graduated sanctions

The registration contract of accredited registrars:

- Updating of the registration contract for 2024 with introduction of the notions of graduated sanctions and financial sanctions

Implementation of the project: the first French milestones

- **1 January 2024** – Entry into force
- **18 January 2024** – Test sending of data for December
- **23 January 2024** – Exchanges on Registrar Day
- **5 February 2024** – Sending of first report on data for January 2024

- **From 5 February 2024** – Gathering of feedback from registrars
- **5 March 2024** – Sending of the second report, on data for February 2024

Monthly reports:

Sent in the form of emails with attachments for each TLD in which abusive incidents are reported (.fr, .pm, .re, .tf, .wf, .yt)

The attachments are files in CSV format containing lists of domain names reported as being involved in abuse on the lists aggregated by the provider CleanDNS. For each domain name listed, the category of abuse is identified.

The email also contains the rate of abuse calculated by TLD in the portfolio of the registrar concerned.

Main points of feedback from registrars

- First action reports received
- The problem of spam
- Request for Afnic to restate the data so as to isolate spam messages from promotional campaigns instead of counting them in the rate of abuse
- The completeness of the information provided relative to the list of domain names
- Complementary elements allowing more accurate description of the abuse and the context in which a given domain name has been flagged
- Proof of abuse of a domain name
- URLs and screenshots for cases of phishing
- What actions and what deadlines?

Follow-up?

- Overall, the reports received were good and sufficient, for example feedback on the analyses made of the list received, statements of actions undertaken and closing of files.
- As regards the large number of spam messages detected, we are looking at better categorisation of spam messages in order to distinguish abusive spam from

promotional email campaigns. This is a necessary exercise for our community in order to understand the impact of spam on our performance in terms of abuse compared with countries such as Denmark, Belgium or the Netherlands.

- The completeness of the information provided relative to the list of domain names
Discussions are under way with Clean DNS to identify the complementary information that could be provided with the monthly lists
- What actions and what deadlines?

The monthly sending of lists corresponds to the reporting of cases of abuse, while remaining under the threshold set for the abuse rate means compliance.

It is the registrars' responsibility to take such actions as they consider appropriate to keep their abuse rates below the limits

The discussions and questions-and-answers between the members and Afnic allowed the following points to be clarified:

With effect from 5 April 2024, contracts signed by gTLD registries and registrars with ICANN will be amended to strengthen the obligations for combating abuse.

The question was asked as to whether there was a link between the Abuse Report service proposed by Afnic for gTLDs and the reports sent each month to .fr registrars in the context of the system of graduated sanctions, which are drawn up from databases aggregated by Clean DNS.

Afnic confirmed that these were two distinct services.

Certain members (registrars) wanted the monthly graduated sanctions reports to provide more information. On this point, Afnic indicated that it was looking at ways to enrich the data but it reminded registrars that each registrar must complete the information it receives whenever abuse was detected involving domain names for which it is responsible.

4.3. Launch of the TWG on Abuse

Launch of the first TWG (Thematic Working Group): on ABUSE

Context:

Members' request in the last consultative committee meeting to be able to exchange and work more regularly on this fundamental subject.

Different *modus operandi* from that of the OWG, which works on a subject/service/product between two consultative committee meetings and the outcome of which is submitted to consultation.

The TWG covers a deliberately broad theme: members and Afnic coordinators can choose to work on a particular subject within the theme for a particular time.

The TWG must also allow shared vigilance on this subject in a simple way (by sending a link, for example).

This first TWG falls within the roadmap for renewing the association's promise.

It may be followed by other TWGs at the request of members and/or Afnic, subject to discussion of the scope within a consultative committee meeting.

The scope

"Abuse" covers a multitude of sins: usages, identification, prediction, actions, expectations... which are not the same for Afnic and its various Registrar and User members (IP firms, registered holders, etc.)

Beyond the domain name actors, many other parties, such as the public at large and the authorities, also have to be taken into account and have this explained to them

The first meeting or the first exchanges of the TWG must serve to define the subjects on which the TWG will work in the coming months (patterns in domain names or in holder data, use cases, etc.)

Coordination of the TWG: Marianne Georgelin (Legal Director), Support depending on subjects: Benoit Ampeau (or Partnerships and Innovation employee) and Emilie Turbat (or Marketing & Commercial employee)

Call for members* to participate in the TWG on Abuse in session today and by email from next week

Pierre Bonis reminded those present that two themes had been raised at the last consultative committee meeting concerning patterns in holder's data and also the identification of practical cases of designation of abusive domain names for which Afnic had difficulty obtaining information.

5. Subjects raised by members through their representatives

5.1. List of terms subject to prior review

The subject of the list of terms subject to prior review had already been raised several times in the past. As a reminder, Afnic drew up a list of domain names, the registration of which was subject to prior review, before the legal and regulatory framework governing the .fr domain and the French overseas TLDs managed by Afnic was established.

These terms are grouped into several categories such as crimes, infractions, names of countries, regulated professions, etc., and also names of French communes.

Their registration is not prohibited as such, but persons wishing to register them must first send a substantiated request to Afnic and make sure that the domain name:

- is not liable to disrupt public order or morality, or the rights guaranteed by the French Constitution or French law;
- is not liable to infringe intellectual property rights or personal rights or is not identical or similar to that of the French Republic, a local authority or grouping of local authorities (...) unless the Claimant provides proof of a legitimate interest and is acting in good faith.

Afnic's position as regards this list is generally one of agreement, as the idea is not to add new words, nor to eliminate it, since it works relatively effectively.

Marianne Georgelin, Director, Legal and Registry Policy, specified that Afnic only validated domain names, never the content that might be associated with it.

Someone asked whether refusal to allocate a domain name could be grounds for legal action. The answer is Yes. If Afnic refuses to allocate a domain name, the applicant can appeal the decision before the Administrative Tribunal.

There was also a question as to the number of requests per year for terms subject to prior review. This was regular and mainly concerned names of communes.

Pierre Bonis said that this was an interesting subject and asked members whether they thought it should be raised in a consultative committee meeting. Six members replied in the affirmative to this proposal. The other members thought it was important to discuss it but not necessarily to make it the subject of consultation.

6. Presentation of points submitted for consultation with members

6.1. Financing options for the 11% general interest beyond the amount earmarked for the Foundation and for actions with the International College

6.1.1. Presentation by Afnic

11% of turnover from the .fr domain, which represents approximately €1.9 million, is invested in projects of general interest, as per the commitment made in the context of the agreement between Afnic and the French State.

Afnic is committed to guaranteeing payment of at least €1.3 million to the Afnic Foundation for Digital Solidarity.

Other actions by Afnic fall within these general interest disbursements around digital transition themes such as the free digital training and support programme (*Foliweb*) which represents approximately €200,000 per year.

In contrast, the *Tous En Ligne Maintenant* (“All Online Now”) support actions are partly financed by Bpifrance in the context of the French State’s economic recovery plan.

In 2023, Afnic also disbursed €20,000 to the endowment of the IETF, a general interest body seeking to diversify its funding.

Disbursements linked to the International College, on the one hand for training and the International College Days and, on the other, through the Coalition for Digital Africa, account for approximately €150,000 a year of the general interest disbursements.

Lastly, the number of person-days spent on training and skills transfers must also be taken into account.

Pierre Bonis asked members whether there were any fields of activity not mentioned in which Afnic could invest or themes that they wished to see addressed.

6.1.2. Feedback from Registrars' and Users' Consultative Committees

Editor's note: for the avoidance of doubt, we would point out that, as was proposed in the context of the renewal of the association's promise, the chairs of the committees had 15 days in which to send the committees' opinions by email to Afnic, as opposed to giving them in the meeting as had been the case previously. As a result of this new arrangement, Afnic was not able to respond in the meeting to certain questions or remarks from members.

Users

Among the initiatives proposed by the Users' Consultative Committee were:

- A targeted action aimed at students and young persons with supplementary means for this purpose. Some users proposed offering trips allowing students to take part in international Internet governance meetings.
- Payment of Afnic scholarships to Internet students
- Preparation of Internet-related teaching and research chairs. Some users proposed that these chairs be launched in association with Inria, the National Institute for Research in Digital Science and Technology. Others proposed that these chairs be oriented towards the online defence of AOP and AOC (protected and controlled designation of origin).

- Afnic's participation in W3C
- Ensuring domain names are taken into account in establishing a digital identity
- An awareness-raising action aimed at elected officials (politicians) to improve their knowledge of the stakes at play in matters relating to the Internet.

Registrars

The registrars did not have time to address the theme of general interest in the separate committee meetings.

6.2. 2024 action plan for renewal of the Association's promise

6.2.1. Presentation by Afnic

Develop association events

Events in the provinces – at least one a year

Associated with an event within the Internet ecosystem in the provinces or hosted by one of our members

→ **for 2024:** date and location in the process of being identified for Q4

Create exchanges on topical/social subjects, whether physical, hybrid or remote (webinar) – at least one a year

Extraordinary meeting of the consultative committee, thematic meeting or meeting aimed at a more targeted public (rights holders, IT managers, academia)

→ **for 2024:**

- 1 special extraordinary meeting of the Consultative Committee on NIS 2

- 1 thematic meeting for each priority target group (rights holders, IT managers, academia)

Continue to develop the meetings of the Consultative Committee

- Trim the agenda (start later) to favour physical presence, permitting members to make the trip in a day
- Allow committee chairs to consult other members who are not present in the meeting by not obliging them systematically to give an opinion during the meeting

-> chairs to return opinions within two weeks

- Include subjects proposed by members on the agenda
- Building the roadmap for the next consultative committee meetings together starts today

Members' webinars

- Market trends in domain name and reports of international governance bodies maintained in webinar format (or hybrid) allowing all members to follow them (Registrars, Users and IC)
- Other possible thematic webinars (CSR, etc.)

Strengthen ties of cooperation between members and teams

Strengthen ties of cooperation between members of the association and Afnic's teams.

-> for 2024:

- 2 half-day open-door sessions at Afnic's HQ (partly accessible online) to present the business lines of Afnic's various directorates to members (dates to be set in May and end of September)
- At least 12 participations by Afnic employees (transfer of expertise, round tables, interviews for internal communication, etc.) for our members

Create working/thematic discussion groups (not *ad hoc* like OWGs)

TWGs (Thematic Working Groups)

- Coordinated and moderated by dedicated Afnic personnel
- Sharing of vigilance
- Roadmap and work decided on in the TWG
- Possibility for members an expert more specialised than the one present in the consultative committee meeting take part in the TWG

→ for 2024: launch of the TWG on Abuse → Call for participation launched today.

Showcase members and their expertise

Ask members to speak about their field of expertise in meetings organised by Afnic

- Afnic will approach members in advance

Have members provide with their expertise during meetings co-organised by Afnic

- Afnic will approach members in advance depending on the themes identified (e.g. IGF France)

Suggest to members that they “co-write” papers with Afnic

Offers of services / tariff discounts

Tariff discount on Afnic training programmes

- Natural persons: one training programme for one person at -50%
- Legal person: one training programme for two persons maximum, at -50%
- Limited to once a year per member

Hire of our training and meeting rooms

- Free hire depending on availability and excluding commercial events.
- Only ancillary services will be charged: e.g. catering, sound system, etc.
- For requests for access to training rooms for commercial events, 10% discount for members

Discount on membership fee for introducing new members

→ For 2024 and 2025:

- 3 “recruitments” among the priority target groups (academia, IT managers, rights holders) will entitle members to free membership in year N+1.

For the International College in particular

Strengthen financing of the collective projects of our counterpart members

→ For 2024

- Donor partners (the OIF (*Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie*), AFD (French Development Agency), the UNDP, etc.) participate in IC Days and announce financing of certain actions.

Circulate information / enliven the community – Roadmap 2025

Create new TWGs

- According to members’ requests or at the proposal of Afnic
- The theme of a TWG, its scope and the Afnic person coordinating it will be shared in a consultative committee meeting prior to launch.

Create a discussion forum

- To facilitate exchanges with Afnic and among members
- With the possibility of creating themed groups for the TWGs
- Draft terms of reference in 2024 for proposal to members in 2025

Communication – Overhaul of the sign-up page and brochure

Communicate and promote the association – Members are our best ambassadors

Make a members' testimonial video to generate interest

-> for 2024:

- Make a short video with a few members (idem teasing for Scientific Council Day): why be a member of Afnic, what you get out of it, the meaning, etc.
- This will be on the sign-up page of the website and could be used during events

Create an easy, practical kit for ambassador members

- Email, brochure, message to allow members who so wish to recruit new members and promote the association

Improve the welcome we extend to new members – Creation of an onboarding document

To improve the welcome extended to future members but also to current members, who may feel they lack information:

- Personalise the life of the association and relations among members and between members and staff
- 1 message from the chairman, from the CEO
- Identification of useful contacts (Head of Governance of the Association, Communication, their elected representatives, etc.)
- Photographs of people and events
- Links to all useful resources
- etc.

Afnic will need its members to finalise this document

Recruitment of new members

- No change in membership fees
- We currently have “active” members and “supporting” members, who support what Afnic does and what it represents.
- **We are also keen to gain new members**

The priority recruitment targets validated by the Board of Trustees are:

- Academia
- IT professionals
- Representatives of rights holders

This list is not exhaustive. The association also welcomes other categories of members: registrars, Internet professionals, enterprises, users, associations or federations, international college, etc.

These actions are for you, and we need you in order to carry them out!

- Events in the provinces → **If you'd like to host Afnic and its members in 2024 or 2025, please let us know!**
- Create exchanges on topical/social subjects → **Share your ideas on themes for these meetings!**
- Strengthen the ties of cooperation between members and teams through the involvement of Afnic employees take part (transfer of expertise, round tables, interviews, etc.) for our members → **Tell us about you needs, your wishes!**
- TWGs (Thematic Working Groups)→ **What other TWGs would you like to see set up?**
- “Co-write” papers with Afnic → **Tell us about your needs, your wishes!**
- Hire of our training and meeting rooms → **Ask us!**
- Create a discussion forum → **Examples of discussion forums that you use and appreciate**
- Make a members' testimonial video to generate interest → **Want to take part?**

- Creation of an onboarding document → **Essential things to include? Are you willing to take part in a creation meeting and then a finalisation meeting?**

6.2.2. Feedback from Registrars' and Users' Consultative Committees

Editor's note: for the avoidance of doubt, we would point out that, as was proposed in the context of the renewal of the association's promise, the chairs of the committees had 15 days in which to send the committees' opinions by email to Afnic, as opposed to giving them in the meeting as had been the case previously. As a result of this new arrangement, Afnic was not able to respond in the meeting to certain questions or remarks from members.

Users

The Users' Consultative Committee welcomed Afnic's initiative to renew the association's promise. It considered that among the various measures envisaged, it was necessary to single out some priorities. The users' committee also expressed the wish to be better informed of the follow-up given to Afnic's various calls for projects.

Among the suggested priorities singled out by the users' committee were:

- Production of an onboarding document for distribution to potential future members
- A targeted action aimed at young people, in association with student organisations of the various schools and universities. Some users expressed a wish for Afnic to set up scholarships for students, or short-term work or work/study contracts for the public at large.
- An annual event in the provinces, to be targeted on the major Internet hubs (such as Marseille). This event could be held back-to-back or coupled with other local events of interest to the same categories of business, over two days for example.

- An event in the form of a video-conference bringing together several regional hubs that meet physically in each of the major cities, possibly arranged as local round tables which would take turns to speak.
- Organisation of feedback meeting on dealings with ICANN involving all participants, not just Afnic employees. This need for feedback was echoed by several committee members. More broadly, the need for a working group on Internet governance.
- A targeted action aimed at the CNCPI, the French IP lawyers' institute, to raise Afnic's profile among this group of professionals
- Vigilance for better documentation, simple and more complete, of Afnic's various working groups, with minutes distributed systematically
- The need for a report on what has already been done as regards the association's promise
- Care as regards actions that are too time-consuming for members (videos to be recorded, articles to write)

Registrars

The registrars' committee made the following observations concerning the renewal of the association's promise:

Event in the provinces:

- Will expenses (train and hotel) be reimbursed in full or partly?
- Would it be possible to see the geographic distribution of Registrars and Users to determine where would be the best location?
- In any case, we must continue to allow for remote participation

Exchanges on topical subjects:

- Make provision for calls for topics + planning (registrars only) without associating them with Consultative Committee Meetings

Development of Consultative Committee Meetings:

- Complete documentation should be provided in advance (to avoid discovering documents during the meeting): make the documents denser so as to allow for lighter interventions in the committee meetings and more exchanges in the plenary session
- Prepare a guide to the terms used in the documents sent
- Stick to the timetable and allow time for exchanges (timekeeper)
- Potentially reduce certain sections (activity report, etc.). People can ask questions if they need more information

Members' webinars:

- More technical subjects (by Régis Massé or Stéphane Bortzmeyer, for example)

Open Day aimed at target groups:

- Attention to the total number of events
- These open days should be geared more to users than to registrars
- For example: INPI (French Patent & Trademark Office)/schools/IP associations (meeting of APRAM (Association of Trade Mark and Design Law Practitioners), etc.) / cyber-security community

TWG:

- Try to get speakers from the “abuse” departments of the major registrars, people from the INPI, people in charge of the security of government websites, etc.

Other subjects were discussed by the registrars and are the subject of feedback in the form of ideas for services that Afnic could propose depending in particular on the historical data that Afnic holds, for example on DNS requests, WHOIS, Reverse WHOIS, FRProtect concerning typosquatting and other conditions. The committee declared itself at Afnic's disposal to explain these proposals sent by email and the rest of the opinions.

7. Upcoming diary dates

Wednesday 3 April 2024 from 2:00 pm to 3:15 pm – Webinar led by Lucien Castex

Report on international bodies

Thursday 25 April 2024 from 4:00 pm to 5:15 pm – Webinar led by Loïc Damilaville

Market trends in domain names

End of April / early May 2024 – Webinar

Presentation of candidate User and Registrar members

Tuesday 4 June 2024, morning

Ordinary General Meeting – Cyber Campus

Thursday 26 September 2024, morning

Legal meetings – Afnic HQ in Guyancourt

Friday 4 October 2024

Afnic Scientific Council Day (JCSA)

Friday 4 October 2024, evening

Afnic annual dinner

Tuesday 15 October 2024

Registrars' and Users' Consultative Committee meetings, *followed by cocktail reception with members of the International College* – Hybrid and Afnic's HQ in Guyancourt

Wednesday 16 and Thursday 17 October 2024

Annual sessions of the International College – Afnic HQ in Guyancourt

Thursday 17 October, afternoon – Webinar (+ physical at Afnic) led by Loïc Damilaville

Market trends in domain names

Monday 25 November, afternoon – Webinar led by Lucien Castex

Report on international bodies

Pierre Bonis thanked all members present both physically and online for their participation.